```
Page 1
 1
                      IN THE DISTRICT COURT
 2
                      95th JUDICIAL DISTRICT
 3
                      DALLAS COUNTY, TEXAS
 4
 5
 6
     LINDA BATISTE,
 7
                       Plaintiff,
                                         No. DC-12-14350
 8
               -vs-
 9
     JOHN ROBERT McNABB, M.D.,
     JOHNSON & JOHNSON, and
10
     ETHICON, INC.,
                       Defendants.
11
12
13
14
15
          DEPOSITION OF MICHAEL THOMAS MARGOLIS, M.D.
16
17
                         November 26, 3013
18
     DATE:
19
                         9:08 a.m.
     TIME:
20
                         Pulone Reporting Services, Inc.
     LOCATION:
                         1550 The Alameda
21
                         Suite 150
                         San Jose, California 95126
22
                         Diane S. Martin, CSR 6464, CCRR
     REPORTED BY:
23
24
25
```

Page 82 Page 84 1 little bit? I mean, a site on my website? 1 THE WITNESS: Well, I'm going to hold to my 2 MR. FREESE: Do you mean like a link? 2 prior answer. 3 BY MR. BROWN: 3 BY MR. BROWN: 4 Q. Do you have a reference? 4 Q. Which is that you can't do it as you sit here 5 5 A. References. today; correct? 6 Q. Let me restate it then. 6 A. I'm not going to speculate and give you an 7 Do you have a reference on your website that 7 incorrect answer. I won't speculate. shows the Burch is the gold standard for stress urinary 8 Q. Doctor, you told us yesterday that you read 8 9 incontinence? 9 literature every day; right? 10 A. A reference list? I don't think I have quoted 10 A. I do. or published a reference list. Q. And you have the statement on here that says 11 11 12 Q. Doctor, you know at times that you make a "the 'gold standard' is the procedure for stress 12 urinary incontinence." It's the gold standard and you 13 statement and then you put a reference below; is that 13 14 correct? 14 can't state to me one article today as we sit here that A. In publications you do so, that is correct. 15 15 says that the Burch is the current gold standard? Q. And my question to you is, do you have a MR. FREESE: All right. First of all, I 16 16 reference on your website that supports the statement 17 17 object. It's argumentative. It's been asked three 18 that the Burch is the current gold standard for stress 18 times and answered. And apparently you just don't 19 urinary incontinence? 19 accept his answer. 20 A. I ever -- I do not have a reference list on my 20 So I'm going to instruct you not to answer the 21 website. 21 question. It's argumentative. MR. BROWN: Okay. Then I'll restate it. 22 Q. You don't have a reference at all? 22 23 A. Correct. No reference. 23 BY MR. BROWN: 24 Q. Doctor, please identify for me the article 24 Q. Can you identify an article in the last five 25 that says that Burch is the current gold standard? 25 years that says that the Burch is the current gold Page 83 A. I can --1 1 standard for stress urinary incontinence as you sit 2 2 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the here today? 3 3 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the question. 4 Go ahead. 4 question. Asked and answered. 5 THE WITNESS: I can get you articles that 5 Go ahead and answer. support that position. 6 6 THE WITNESS: I'm going to hold to my prior 7 BY MR. BROWN: 7 answer. 8 Q. As you sit here today, Doctor, can you point 8 BY MR. BROWN: 9 to an article that says that the Burch is the current 9 Q. Which is? A. You know, the same that I gave before. 10 gold standard? 10 11 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 11 Q. Yes, you can, no you can't, or "I don't know," 12 auestion. 12 Doctor? A. Okay. 13 THE WITNESS: I'll stick with my answer. I 13 14 can get you articles that support that position. 14 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 15 BY MR. BROWN: 15 question. Asked and answered. THE WITNESS: As I've stated already, I'll be 16 Q. That's not my question, Doctor. My question 16 happy to get you some articles, but I don't have one 17 to you --17 18 A. Well, I can't give you off the top of my head 18 that I can quote right now because I don't want to 19 right now a direct quote. There are plenty of articles 19 speculate or give you an inaccurate answer. 20 and -- but I can't quote one to you directly. 20 BY MR. BROWN: Q. Can you identify as you sit here today an 21 21 Q. Okay. Doctor, can you identify any of the article in the last five years that has said that Burch major professional organizations that we discussed 22 22 is the current gold standard? 23 23 earlier that identify Burch as the current gold MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 24 standard for stress urinary incontinence? 24 25 MR. FREESE: Object. Asked and answered. 25 question.

Page 90 Page 92 1 Q. Let me restate that. and documents, internal documents, I think they should 1 2 If you'll go back to the first page, please. 2 be removed. Under number 1. The second sentence says, "Neither the 3 3 BY MR. BROWN: FDA advisory panel, the NIH, the American College of 4 4 Q. Doctor, if you'll turn to page 3. You see Obstetrics and Gynecology, ACOG, nor AUGS has 5 5 where it says in the first sentence under number 5, do recommended removing any mesh products from the market you see where it says, "2011 FDA warning"? 6 6 7 or withholding them from surgeon use." 7 A. Correct. Do you agree that's in the position statement? 8 8 Q. Do you see where it says "the 2011 FDA 9 A. Where is that? I'm sorry. 9 warning, however, the warning was about transvaginal 10 MR. FREESE: It's right here. 10 mesh for prolapse." 11 THE WITNESS: Oh, I'm sorry. I see it. Do you see that? 11 12 Yes. 12 A. Correct. BY MR. BROWN: 13 13 Q. Do you agree or disagree that the 2011 FDA 14 Q. Do you disagree or agree with that, Doctor? 14 warning was only about transvaginal mesh for prolapse? A. That's what they wrote. MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 15 15 Q. No. I'm asking you, do you disagree with that 16 16 question. statement or do you agree with it? 17 17 THE WITNESS: They are accurate that that's 18 A. I don't disagree that that's what they wrote. 18 what the FDA warning in 2011 was about. 19 Q. Doctor, that's not what I'm asking you. BY MR. BROWN: 19 20 A. Well, I'm misunderstanding you. 20 Q. About transvaginal meshes for prolapse only? 21 Q. I'm asking you, in your training, experience 21 A. Correct. 22 and education do you agree as you sit here today with 22 Q. Doctor, you agree that the full-length the statement that we just read? midurethral slings including TVT-O were excluded from 23 23 24 A. I don't disagree that neither the FDA advisory 24 post marketing studies? panel, the NIH, the ACOG or AUGS has recommended 25 25 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the Page 93 removing any mesh. That what they state is factually 1 1 question. 2 2 correct. THE WITNESS: I believe that's accurate. 3 3 Q. Okay. Do you agree or disagree that mesh BY MR. BROWN: 4 products for stress urinary incontinence should be 4 Q. Are you aware of the FDA requesting Ethicon to 5 withheld from surgeon use? 5 provide additional post-marketing studies for its TVT Obturator? A. Transvaginal synthetic mesh materials, I 6 6 7 assume you're referring to? 7 A. Not that I'm aware of. 8 Q. Yes. 8 Q. Doctor, if you continue to go down I'm looking 9 A. I think -- I believe that once an accurate and 9 at the last sentence where it says, "Full-length thorough understanding of all the pros and cons and all midurethral slings, both retropubic and transobturator, 10 10 of the literature and data on these materials is known have been extensively studied, are safe and effective, 11 11 12 to everyone, including the failure to warn of all the 12 relative to other treatment options, and remain the risks, that most physicians will choose not to use it leading treatment option and current gold standard of 13 13 14 and will come to the conclusion that they should not be 14 care for stress urinary incontinence surgery." You agree that that is accurately read in the 15 used. 15 AUGS position statement? 16 Q. Doctor, my question to you --16 A. And should be pulled from the market. A. That is an accurately read opinion of those 17 17 Q. Do you as you sit here today believe that who wrote this position statement, which is a minority 18 18 19 transvaginal midurethral synthetic slings should be 19 of the AUGS members. So yes, it is accurately read. removed from the market? 20 20 Q. Your testimony is that this is a minority of 21 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 21 the AUGS members? question. Asked and answered. 22 22 A. Well, whoever wrote this is a small -- I mean, Go ahead and answer it again. 23 23 the entire body of AUGS didn't write this. A small 24 THE WITNESS: "Most" would include me. So cadre of individuals, members of AUGS wrote this, 24 knowing what I know, having reviewed all of the data 25 riaht? 25

Page 102 Page 104 MS. REMINGTON: A comfort break. 1 1 BY MR. BROWN: 2 MR. BROWN: Sure. 2 Q. Let me ask you that then. 3 3 (Recess taken.) A. It's not a bill. It was a resolution that BY MR. BROWN: 4 4 failed. 5 5 Q. Just so I understand it correctly, this Q. Doctor, does literature today identify another procedure as the gold standard? resolution that you were a proponent for failed; is 6 6 7 A. Yes. I think there is some. 7 that correct? 8 8 Q. And what is that procedure, Doctor? A. That is correct. 9 A. The Burch. 9 Q. And, Doctor, do you know if the AUGS board of 10 Q. Are there other studies that identify the 10 directors strongly opposed your resolution 105-12? midurethral slings as the current gold standard? 11 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 11 12 A. There are those who argue it. That's their 12 question. 13 opinion. 13 THE WITNESS: I believe they did. 14 Q. Is the answer to my question yes, Doctor? 14 BY MR. BROWN: A. There are those who say so. 15 15 Q. Do you know if SUFU -- what is SUFU, S-U-F-U? A. The Society for Urodynamic study. You know --Q. So just so I have a clean question here, is 16 16 there literature that identifies the midurethral sling Urodynamic Female Urology, something like that. 17 17 as the current gold standard? 18 Q. Doctor, do you know if the ACOG board opposed 18 resolution 105-12? MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 19 19 question. 20 A. One individual from ACOG, the vice president, 20 21 wrote a letter opposing it. And by the way, the 21 You may answer. president of AUGS opposed it. 22 THE WITNESS: There are documents which you 22 have, of course, already brought to my attention that I don't know actually if the board opposed 23 23 say so, so the answer is yes. 24 it. I do know that a letter was written from AUGS 24 BY MR. BROWN: 25 president and from ACOG vice president, both of which 25 Page 103 Page 105 Q. Is the TVT Obturator a midurethral sling? 1 opposed it, but I don't know about their board. 1 A. The TVT Obturator is a midurethral sling. 2 So I guess to be clear on the prior answer and 2 3 Q. Doctor, are you familiar with a California 3 this answer, those individuals wrote letters opposing 4 resolution 105-12? 4 it, but I don't know about the boards. 5 A. Can you read it for me? 5 (DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT 13 WAS MARKED.) 6 Q. I'll give it to you. 6 BY MR. BROWN: (DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT 12 WAS MARKED.) 7 7 Q. Doctor, I'm handing you Exhibit 13. 8 THE WITNESS: I am familiar with this 8 I believe you stated in your designation that 9 document. 9 you gave testimony at the FDA; is that correct? 10 A. That is correct. 10 BY MR. BROWN: 11 Q. And I believe that testimony was September 8, 11 Q. Doctor, were you the proponent of this 12 resolution? 12 2011? A. Correct. 13 A. I was a co-proponent. Dr. Reeves Chalmers, 13 14 R-e-e-v-e-s, last name C-h-a-l-m-e-r-s, was the 14 Q. I believe this was on your reliance list; is that correct, Doctor? 15 15 A. I hope so. 16 Q. Doctor, did the AUGS board of directors 16 Q. If not, we'll make it. 17 strongly oppose this resolution? 17 18 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 18 A. I appreciate that. 19 19 MR. FREESE: We're going to do a battlefield question. 20 THE WITNESS: Members of the CMA house of 20 supplemental. delegates who represented AUGS and who refused to 21 BY MR. BROWN: 21 acknowledge their financial support did oppose this Q. Doctor, again, I'm not trying to be 22 22 resolution, which did, by the way, fail. So this is sarcastic. Not trying to insult your intelligence 23 23 actually technically not a resolution because it 24 24 here, but -failed. 25 A. It wouldn't take much insulting. 25

Page 114 Page 116 commonly studied procedure using mesh for stress 1 Q. Do you see that, Doctor? 2 urinary incontinence repair is the TVT procedure? 2 A. I do. A. The most commonly studied procedure using mesh 3 3 Q. And you stated, "I hope the FDA will, through for SUI is the TVT? Probably so. firm action, help save others from the painful 4 4 5 Q. Doctor, do you agree or disagree that there 5 experiences that thousands of unfortunate women have are at least 80 RCTs with at least one arm randomized had to suffer through so far." 6 6 7 for surgical mesh for the treatment of SUI? 7 Did I accurately read that? 8 A. I agree that there are that many articles. 8 A. Yes, you do, thank you. 9 Q. Has the FDA that you're aware of ever stated 9 Q. And were you proposing that midurethral 10 that the Burch has unparalleled high success rates? 10 synthetic slings be taken off the market? 11 MR. FREESE: Are you asking if he's ever said A. Ultimately I was hoping that they would do so. 11 12 12 Q. Are you finished, Doctor? that? 13 MR. BROWN: The FDA. 13 14 MR. FREESE: Oh. 14 Q. And that's what I'm asking. Were you proposing that the FDA take the TVT off the market? 15 THE WITNESS: I'm not aware of the FDA stating 15 A. At the time I was hoping that they would study 16 that. 16 it more, get more information from industry, from every 17 BY MR. BROWN: 17 18 Q. Are you aware that the FDA came out with an 18 available source, and come to the conclusion that we executive summary for the September 8th and 9th, 2011 are arguing here today, that they should be removed 19 19 20 conference that you attended? 20 from the market. MR. FREESE: I'm sorry, would you ask that 21 Q. And you were arguing that they should be 21 22 question again, Michael? 22 removed from the market, the midurethral synthetic BY MR. BROWN: 23 23 slings: correct? 24 Q. Yes. Are you aware that the FDA had an 24 MR. FREESE: Objection. Asked and answered. 25 executive summary for the September 8th and 9th, 2011 25 THE WITNESS: I'm going to stick with my Page 115 Page 117 FDA meeting that you attended? 1 answer I already gave. 1 2 A. It was a hearing, actually. And I believe 2 BY MR. BROWN: 3 they did. And I testified at the hearing. Not 3 Q. I'm not sure I understand the second part. I 4 attended. So ... 4 think you said "we." And so what I'm doing is 5 5 Q. I think, Doctor, you identify number 5 on your asking -reference list as the FDA executive summary; is that A. Did I say we? 6 6 7 MR. BROWN: Can you read back? I think you 7 correct? 8 A. You know, yes. I'm pretty sure. Okay. 8 said "we" and I just want to make sure. 9 Thanks. Thank you. 9 THE WITNESS: No, I don't think I said "we." Q. So that's a document that you've reviewed 10 10 Did I? before: correct. Doctor? 11 11 MR. FREESE: You were saying in French, yes. 12 A. Yes. Though I haven't kept it -- though I 12 (Record read by the court reporter as follows: 13 "A: At the time I was hoping that they would 13 haven't put it to memory, no. 14 Q. Doctor, are you aware of any statement that 14 study it more, get more information from has come from the FDA that says that there are high 15 15 industry, from every available source, and 16 complication and low success rates for midurethral 16 come to the conclusion that we are arguing 17 here today, that they should be removed from 17 synthetic slings? 18 18 A. I can't quote you any FDA source as I sit the market.") 19 19 MR. FREESE: He's saying "we," as in you and here. 20 Q. Doctor, if you look on the -- your FDA 20 he are arguing. presentation, if you'll go to the second-to-last page. 21 THE WITNESS: Right. Thank you. 21 The I guess you'd say second-to-last paragraph starts MR. FREESE: So if you want to ask the 22 22 23 with the sentence, "I hope." 23 question again now, I'll just object. So the answer is Do you see that? 24 24 clear.

THE WITNESS: That you and I are -- yeah,

25

A. Second to last sentence, I see.

Page 118 Page 120 answer that you believe so? that's what I meant. 1 2 BY MR. BROWN: 2 A. Whatever I said. But I would like to see that 3 3 Q. I'm not sure what you meant, which is why I'm document. trying to ask it. So let me ask my question again. 4 4 MR. BROWN: Would you read it back? MR. FREESE: I think what he's trying to do, 5 MR. FREESE: Let him ask the question again. 5 Michael, is to find context to the sentence. 6 He'll start over. 6 7 THE WITNESS: All right. 7 (Record read by the court reporter as follows: 8 8 "Q: To your recollection, Doctor, do you BY MR. BROWN: 9 9 remember saying that the FDA got caught with Q. Were you proposing or arguing that the midurethral synthetic slings should be taken off the 10 10 their pants down?") market in your presentation to the FDA? MR. FREESE: That's a good sign. He's putting 11 11 12 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 12 stuff back in that red rope of his. question. 13 13 MR. BROWN: Maybe. MR. FREESE: Oh, no, another one. 14 Go ahead. 14 THE WITNESS: There goes lunch. 15 THE WITNESS: Well, again, you keep on calling 15 it presentation. It was testimony. But yes. (Discussion off the record.) 16 BY MR. BROWN: 17 BY MR. BROWN: 17 18 Q. Okay. And the FDA did not mandate that 18 Q. Doctor, is it still your position today as you sit here that the Burch procedure is the procedure of midurethral slings should be taken off the market; is 19 19 choice for most patients, given its unparalleled high 20 that correct? 20 success rates of approximately 90 percent nationwide? A. As of yet they have not. 21 21 22 Q. Okay. And specifically, the FDA has not 22 A. Absolutely. mandated that the TVT Obturator be removed from the 23 23 Q. Is it your position, Doctor, that the Burch market; is that correct? has higher success rates than the TVT? 24 24 25 25 A. Yes. A. As of yet they have not. Page 119 Page 121 Q. Today, Doctor, has the FDA mandated that the 1 Q. Can you, as you sit here today, point to a 1 2 TVT Obturator be taken from the market? 2 study that says that the Burch has unparalleled high A. As of yet, they have not. That would be up to 3 success rates, or words to that effect? 3 4 right this moment. 4 A. Those are already in my statement. 5 Q. Doctor, did you make a statement right after 5 Q. Maybe I didn't ask that appropriately. Can you point to a study that states that the the FDA hearing that the FDA got caught with their 6 6 7 Burch procedure has unparalleled high success rates? 7 pants down? My question is, did you make that 8 A. I can, but not as I sit here right now. 8 statement? 9 A. I think that's accurate. I think I was called 9 Q. Okay. back up to the microphone, and they asked me some 10 A. I will get them for you. Plus they're also in 10 my -- whatever my -- whatever these documents are questions after my presentation. I'm sure you have the 11 11 12 quote in front of you. I actually would like to hear 12 called. what I said. 13 Q. Your reliance list? 13 14 Q. To your recollection, Doctor, do you remember 14 A. Thank you. Q. And, Doctor, it's interesting that you bring saying that the FDA got caught with their pants down? 15 15 MR. FREESE: Objection. Asked and answered. that up because I read through every document on your 16 16 He's asked you to see what you're referring to. You 17 reliance list. 17 can show it to him or not. 18 A. Cool. 18 19 THE WITNESS: Can I see the document so I can 19 Q. And I couldn't find one that said that the 20 20 answer? Burch had unparalleled high success rates, or words to that effect. BY MR. BROWN: 21 21 Q. I'm just asking if you remember that, Doctor? 22 MR. FREESE: Okay. Well, first of all, I 22 A. I've answered the question. Now I'd like to 23 23 object to that. 24 see the document that you're referring to. 24 MR. BROWN: Well, let me --25 Q. I might have missed your answer, but is your 25 MR. FREESE: Okay. You're right. Go ahead.

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

15

16

17

18

19

1

2

6

8

9

12

13

18

19

20

Page 126

So in answer to your question, everything I've said about the Burch applies to the MMK, just to save 3 time.

BY MR. BROWN:

2

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

25

1

8

9

12

13

14

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

- Q. Sure. So am I accurate in saying according to your website, when it says that the Burch has unparalleled high success rates, approximately 90 percent, that that would also apply to MMK?
 - A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Doctor, are you aware of success rates sharply declining after five years with the MMK?
 - A. They don't sharply decline.
- 13 Q. Is there an average, in your opinion, decline of success after five years for MMK? 14
- A. The ten-year success rate for the MMK/Burch is 15 in the 90 percent range. 16
- Q. Did you say ten year? 17
- 18 A. The ten year.
- Q. Have you seen studies, Doctor, that show that 19 20 the MMK has success rates around 58 percent at ten 21 years?
- 22 A. If you have a study you would like to quote, I'm sure I'd be happy to review it. I'm sure there are 23 studies that say that. 24
 - Q. All right, Doctor, do you still have Exhibit

1 Q. Doctor, you know a lot of times that in

peer-reviewed publications, they'll have a conclusion 3 section?

Page 128

Page 129

- A. Correct.
- Q. And oftentimes they'll -- strike that.

Are you aware of any peer-reviewed published literature that indicates that the TVT is not effective?

MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the auestion.

THE WITNESS: Well, sure. I mean, the studies 11 12 that I argue showing all the TVT complications are in effect saving it's not effective. 13

14 BY MR. BROWN:

- Q. What study is that, Doctor?
- A. Well, we can go over if you want, and I can pull some articles and come back with the exact quotes for you, but I mean, I argued with references that the TVT has a high complication rate, and a low success
- rate, and I can get those articles and lay them out for 20
- you again. So I mean, if you give us a little time. 21
- 22 But there's plenty of data in peer-reviewed journal,
- RCT included, of studies showing that the TVT has got 23 issues. 24
- 25 Q. Doctor, as you sit here today can you point to

Page 127

- 10 in front of you, which is your website?
- 2 A. Okay.
- 3 Q. All right, Doctor, I'm now on your third 4 paragraph. Do you see where it says, "Well-publicized 5 high complication and low success rates of synthetic slings"? 6
- A. I do. 7
 - Q. And is that still your position today?
 - A. Yes.
- Q. Doctor, have you ever seen a study that says 10 that the TVT is not safe? 11

MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the question.

MR. BROWN: Let me restate it then.

15 BY MR. BROWN:

> Q. Doctor, are you aware of a peer reviewed -strike that.

> Doctor, are you aware of a peer-reviewed publication that indicates that the TVT is not safe?

- A. We've gone through a lot of articles that discuss the complications associated with the TVT. Has any one of them said the TVT is not safe,
- quote/unquote? I can't give you an answer to that.

24 I don't know of any study as I sit here now that says, quote/unquote, the TVT is not safe. 25

a study that says that the TVT is not effective? MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the

3 question. 4 THE WITNESS: I'll get them for you. As I've just described. I'll be happy to bring them back, and

we'll go through them one at a time.

7 BY MR. BROWN:

Q. Doctor, respectfully, I didn't ask you if you could get them. I said, as you sit here today can you point to a study that says that the TVT is not 10 effective? 11

MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the question.

14 THE WITNESS: As I sit here at this moment, at 15 this moment I don't have an article in front of me for 16 you at this moment.

17 BY MR. BROWN:

- Q. Doctor, do you think over the lunch break you could identify a study that says that the TVT is not safe or effective?
- 21 A. I will do what I can.

MR. FREESE: Well, I object to that. So we 22 23 provided you reliance lists. Those documents are 24 available to you.

25 MR. BROWN: Well, Rich, I reviewed them and I

Page 150 Page 152 A. I do. Implantation, sorry. 1 they're falling out of favor. 1 2 Q. So currently at the medical institutions that 2 Q. Yeah. you teach and train at, the midurethral synthetic sling 3 3 Doctor, do you believe that the rat studies is taught; is that correct? correlate to what occurs in humans? 4 4 5 5 A. I believe that animal studies are very A. Correct. important when studying materials and drugs, 6 Q. Doctor, are you going to testify that 6 7 polypropylene causes sarcomas or cancer in humans? 7 particularly materials, and that any mammal response to a material should be considered in the warning labels. 8 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 9 So yes, I think animal studies, and particularly this auestion. 10 THE WITNESS: In humans? 10 animal study should be at least considered and put open 11 to the public for consideration. 11 BY MR. BROWN: Q. Doctor, are you aware of any literature that Q. Yes. 12 12 says that the results of the rat study transferrable to 13 A. That it does cause sarcomas in humans? Was 13 that your question? 14 humans -- let me state it this way. Strike that. 14 Are you aware of any literature that states 15 Q. Yes, sir. 15 A. I don't have evidence to -- to that effect. that the results of the rat study transferrable to 16 16 17 humans and can -- strike it again. Sorry. 17 So no. 18 Q. Is your sole testimony with regard to the 18 Are you aware that Dr. Klinge and Klosterhalfen have stated that the rat study is not material safety data sheets, that Ethicon didn't 19 19 disclose that information to physicians? 20 transferrable to humans? 20 A. Well, that's not my sole testimony. My sole 21 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 21 22 testimony is that Ethicon has failed to disclose a 22 question. whole laundry list of complications and potential 23 THE WITNESS: Could you give me a direct 23 complications. Failure to warn of significant risks, 24 24 quote? BY MR. BROWN: and we'll, I'm sure, go into those risks shortly. 25 25 Page 151 Page 153 Q. We will, so let me narrow down my question 1 Q. I will. 1 2 2 A. Okay, cool. then. 3 (DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT 17 WAS MARKED.) 3 Do you have any clinical evidence that 4 polypropylene causes sarcomas in humans? 4 MR. BROWN: Rich, we'll supplement it for a 5 A. I have no literature to substantiate that. 5 clean copy, but I'm going to have to give him a highlighted copy if that's fine with you. 6 Q. Do you -- let me mark this document. I'm 6 7 MR. FREESE: Sure, that's fine. No problem 7 going to hand you Exhibit 16. It's the MSDS sheet that 8 8 was on your reliance list. with me. 9 (DEFENDANT'S EXHIBIT 16 WAS MARKED.) 9 (Discussion off the record.) THE WITNESS: Thanks. 10 A. Okay. 10 Q. Doctor, how about we look at it together? MR. BROWN: That's 16, Rich. 11 11 12 MR. FREESE: Thank you. 12 A. Okay, sure. 13 Q. Doctor, I've handed you Exhibit 17; is that 13 BY MR. BROWN: 14 Q. This is one of the MSDS sheets that's on your 14 correct? 15 A. Correct. 15 reliance list; is that correct? A. Correct. Q. Doctor, we're looking at the back, which is 16 16 17 Q. I assume you've reviewed it before? 17 page 260, and it says, "Finally, one decisive question remains. Are the results of the rat study 18 18 A. I have. 19 Q. If you'll go to the last page. Do you see 19 transferrable to humans, and can surgical meshes induce malignancies after long-term implementation in decades where it says that polypropylene has been tested in 20 20 21 laboratory rats by subcutaneous implementation of disc 21 in our hernia patients? The answer is no." or powder? 22 Did I read that correctly? 22 A. Yes. 23 23 A. Correct. 24 Q. And it says local sarcomas were induced at the 24 Q. Do you agree or disagree with that statement? site of implementation? 25 A. I disagree. 25

Page 170 Page 172 urinary incontinence. 1 BY MR. BROWN: 1 2 Q. Even severe stress urinary incontinence? 2 Q. Do you know if the symptoms of an adverse 3 A. Including severe. 3 reaction are required by the FDA to be identified in an instructions for use? 4 Q. Doctor, is there a midurethral sling that is 4 5 5 A. That's kind of splitting hairs; isn't it? I safer than the TVT Obturator? mean, adverse reaction by definition is going to have 6 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 6 7 question. 7 the symptoms in it. THE WITNESS: I'd have to look at the data on 8 8 I can't really answer your question the way 9 all the TVT-O competitors, which I don't have in front 9 you've asked it. That doesn't really make sense. MR. BROWN: Well, read it back if you don't 10 of me to answer that accurately. 10 BY MR. BROWN: 11 mind because I'm asking you about if the FDA requires 11 it. So I want to know if you know if the FDA requires Q. So as of right now you don't know? 12 12 A. As of this moment I do not know. it or not, but you can read it back? 13 13 THE WITNESS: The specific symptoms associated 14 Q. Doctor, let's move to the instructions for 14 15 with adverse reactions. 15 use. And you might have already answered this MR. BROWN: If you'll just let her read mine yesterday and if you did, I apologize, but have you 16 ever participated in the drafting of an instructions back and answer that question. 17 17 18 for use? 18 (Record read by the court reporter as follows: "Q: Do you know if the symptoms of an adverse MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 19 19 question. It was asked at length yesterday. 20 reaction are required by the FDA to be 20 identified in an instructions for use?") Go ahead and answer it again. 21 21 22 THE WITNESS: Other than my lecturing or 22 MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the question. I think it's -- I think it's testifying to the FDA and lecturing all over the 23 23 country, I have not. 24 incomprehensible but --24 BY MR. BROWN: 25 THE WITNESS: I don't understand that 25 Page 171 Page 173 Q. Doctor, what is the FDA requirement for 1 question. That doesn't make sense to me. 1 2 2 adverse reactions that are required to be placed into MR. FREESE: And I don't want to quibble, but an instructions for use, if you know? 3 are you saying is a fever a symptom of a fever and 3 therefore you have to disclose the fever as the symptom MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 4 4 5 5 of a fever? I don't understand it. question. MR. BROWN: Will you just object and then let 6 THE WITNESS: In a word that all potential 6 adverse events be written so that surgeons and patients 7 7 him -can make informed decisions. All warnings be made 8 8 MR. FREESE: I'm sorry. I object. 9 open. 9 BY MR. BROWN: Q. Doctor, do you know if the FDA requires that BY MR. BROWN: 10 10 the symptoms be identified --Q. Is that the FDA requirement? 11 11 A. Well, that's not their words. I mean, just in MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 12 12 summary, they require that adverse reactions be 13 question. 13 14 reported. 14 BY MR. BROWN: Q. Doctor, I'm not talking about reporting. I'm Q. -- in an instructions for use? 15 15 talking about an IFU. Let me restate my question. A. As I sit here, I don't know if the symptoms 16 16 A. Well, reported in the IFU. Noted or listed in 17 are required. 17 Q. Doctor, do you agree that the instructions for 18 the IFU. 18 19 Q. Do you know the specific FDA requirement for 19 use is written for physicians? what adverse reaction should be in an instructions for 20 20 A. I do. 21 21 Q. And that -- strike that. use? MR. FREESE: Object to the form of the 22 The physician is to use his training -- strike 22 23 23 question. that.

The physician is to use his or her training,

experience and education in conjunction with the

24

25

THE WITNESS: I can't quote it to you word for

word as I sit here right now.

24

7

8

9

10

13

14

15

16

21

6

11

15

Page 202 1 Q. Doctor, have you ever attended Ethicon's 2 professional education program for TVT? 3 A. No. Q. Have you attended Ethicon's professional 4 education program for any pelvic floor repairs? 5 6

- Q. Have you reviewed Ethicon's professional education video on the TVT Obturator incontinence procedure?
- 10 A. I've reviewed the videos on everything that's 11 out there published. All -- all of the devices that have videos that are open to the -- that are posted on 12 the Web. I've watched. 13
- Q. Let me just -- if you say, "I've already answered it," that's fine, but have you watched a video from Ethicon's professional education on the TVT Obturator?
 - A. I believe I have. If it's on the Web, I've seen it. I've seen -- I've seen all the videos. And if it's available on the Web, then I've seen it. I mean, I've watched every single video that is out there, and if TVT is on that list, I believe I've seen it.
- 24 Q. And does the Ethicon professional education 25 video have an instructor walking through the steps

Page 204 scanning electron microscope or any other kind of 1

- 2 microscope to assess degradation?
- 3 A. No.
- Q. Have you ever assessed any polypropylene mesh 4 under scanning electron microscope or any other kind of 5 microscope to assess degradation? 6
 - A. No.
 - Q. Doctor, are you aware if Ethicon has an antioxidant package for its polypropylene mesh?
- 11 Q. Are you saying no, they do not, or no, you do 12 not know?
 - A. I do not know.
 - Q. Do you know if an antioxidant blend with the polypropylene affects the potential for degradation in a polypropylene mesh?
- A. Could you repeat that guestion? That was a 17 18 little confusing.
- 19 MR. BROWN: I'm going to have to ask you to do 20 that.
 - (Record read by the court reporter as follows:
- 22 "Q: Do you know if an antioxidant blend with
- the polypropylene affects the potential for 23
- 24 degradation in a polypropylene mesh?") 25
 - MR. BROWN: Let me restate that. I said

Page 203

verbally? 1

7

8

9

14

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

4

5

6 7

8

9

10

11 12

13 14

15

16

18

19

20

- 2 A. As I recall, though I can't recall specifics, 3 it did.
 - Q. Doctor, do you know if Ethicon has a professional education called the advanced users forum that teaches and trains on the management of complications?
 - A. I do not.

MR. BROWN: Would you read back my question, because I'm not even sure what I asked exactly. I apologize.

> (Record read by the court reporter as follows: "Q: Doctor, do you know if Ethicon has a professional education called the advanced users forum that teaches and trains on the management of complications?")

BY MR. BROWN: 17

- Q. Doctor, I'm going to talk about degradation. Have you performed any studies on mesh degradation?
- 21 A. No.
- Q. Have you published any studies on mesh 22 23 degradation?
- 24 A. No.
- 25 Q. Have you ever assessed a TVT mesh under

- 1 polypropylene I think too many times.
- 2 BY MR. BROWN:
- 3 Q. Doctor, do you know if an antioxidant blend 4
 - that is incorporated in the polypropylene may prevent
- 5 degradation?
 - A. No.
- 7 Q. You don't know: is that correct?
- 8 A. I don't know that it does.
- 9 Q. Are you saying that it does not, or that you don't know if it does? 10
 - A. I do not know if it does.
- 12 Q. Doctor, can you identify any studies that
- 13 degradation with the TVT has any clinical significance
- 14 if degradation exists?
 - A. There are internal documents that I've
- reviewed, and there are the clinical correlates to what 16
- 17 has been described in the internal documents of mesh as
- it has protruded through the vagina after having been 18
- 19 broken down. But I don't know of any studies.
- 20 Q. Let me ask you this, Doctor: Is it your
- 21 opinion that the TVT mesh degrades?
- 22
- 23 Q. Is it your opinion that degradation that you
- believe occurs with the TVT has clinical significance? 24
 - A. Yes.

Page 205

1

4

5

6

7

8

14

23

24

25

1

7

8

11

12 13

14

Page 206

- 1 Q. And what is that clinical significance, 2 Doctor?
 - A. It breaks down. It is found eroded through the vaginal wall at various locations. It causes --
 - its breakdown causes an increase in the chronic foreign body reaction that is seen in pristine mesh. And I do have concerns that it might be found in other parts of the body as a result of the breakdown.
 - Q. Doctor, have you seen any clinical data that the potentially degraded mesh is found in other parts of the body?
 - A. Other than the eroded -- or, rather, the eroded mesh particles seen -- mesh fragments, that is, seen, which is commonly reported in the literature, no.
 - Q. Are you talking about the mesh that degrades into the vagina, is that what you're talking about, Doctor?
- 18 A. Correct.
- 19 Q. Are you aware of any mesh degradation particles that are found in other places besides the 20 vaginal canal? 21
- 22 A. No.

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

23

24 25

3

7

8 9

13

19

20

21

22

- Q. Doctor, can you identify any literature that the degradation of polypropylene -- restate that.
 - Doctor, do you have any clinical literature

diligence, including a conversation with a physician.

Page 208

Page 209

- 2 Q. Do you provide patient brochures to your 3 patients?
 - A. Well, since I don't put these implants in, I do not.
 - Q. Do you provide patient brochures for any device or -- well, let me ask you this: Do you use any device that would have a patient brochure?
- 9 A. I don't know that Xenform has a brochure. It 10 might. But I don't know if they do, and I don't use 11
- 12 Q. Do you know the pore size of the Prolene mesh?
- A. I know that it's claimed to be macroporous. 13
 - Q. Doctor, do you disagree that it's macroporous?
- A. I think as applied to the patient, it shrinks 15 up, it's microporous, but --16
- 17 Q. You think that Prolene mesh shrinks from its 18 pore size to under ten microns?
- A. I think it shrinks from its implanted size to 19 20 under macroporous.
- Q. I think we said earlier that macroporous was 21 22 75 microns or greater; is that correct?
 - A. Correct.
 - Q. And your testimony is that the -- strike that. Your testimony is that the Prolene mesh in the

Page 207

- that you can point to that degraded polypropylene mesh increases the inflammatory response? 2
- 4 Q. Doctor, I believe you stated that you read
- 5 Ms. Batiste's deposition transcript; is that right? 6
 - A. Yes.
 - Q. And you're aware that Ms. Batiste was not provided a patient brochure; is that correct?
 - A. Correct.
- 10 Q. And you're aware from Ms. Batiste's testimony that she was not provided any marketing materials from 11 12 Ethicon: is that correct?
 - A. I believe that's accurate.
- 14 Q. You have no independent knowledge -- let me 15 restate that question.

Doctor, you will not be opining that 16 Ms. Batiste saw a patient brochure from Ethicon; is 17 that correct? 18

- A. Correct.
- Q. Do you believe that the purpose of a patient brochure is to facilitate a conversation with a patient and the physician?
- 23 A. Well, among other things. I mean, I think the patient brochure should provide accurate information to 24 25 the patient so the patient can do her research and due

TVT contracts below 75 microns in a patient?

- 2 A. I think that's what the internal documents 3 from Ethicon show, correct.
- 4 Q. Doctor, are you aware of any clinical 5 literature that identifies the TVT Prolene mesh
- contracting from its pore size to below 75 microns? 6
 - A. I don't think that that has been studied in the clinical journals or reported.
- 9 Q. Let me just ask you if this refreshes your 10 recollection or not.

Have you seen from Ethicon's documents and potentially Dr. Pamela Moalli's document that the pore size for the Prolene mesh is 1379 microns?

- A. I have.
- 15 Q. Do you agree or disagree with that out of the package? 16 17
 - A. That's what it is claimed.
- 18 Q. And my question to you, Doctor, is do you
- 19 agree or disagree that the pore size of the Prolene
- mesh out of the package is 1379 microns, approximately? 20 21
 - A. I don't recall.
- 22 Q. Doctor, do you know if mechanical cut or laser
- 23 cut mesh was used in Ms. Batiste's TVT-O implant?
- 24 A. Mechanical.
 - Q. Doctor, the Prolene mesh that was used by

53 (Pages 206 to 209)

	Page 282			Page 284
1	REPORTER'S CERTIFICATE	1		9
2	The undersigned Certified Shorthand Reporter		ERRATA	
3	licensed in the State of California does hereby certify:	2		
4	I am authorized to administer oaths or	3	PAGE LINE CHANGE	
5	affirmations pursuant to Code of Civil Procedure, Section	4	DEACON.	
6 7	2093(b), and prior to being examined, the witness was duly administered an oath by me.	5	REASON:	
8	I am not a relative or employee or attorney or	6 7	REASON:	
9	counsel of any of the parties, nor am I a relative or	8	REASON.	
10	employee of such attorney or counsel, nor am I financially	9	REASON:	
11	interested in the outcome of this action.	10		
12	I am the deposition officer who stenographically	11	REASON:	
13	recorded the testimony in the foregoing deposition, and the	12		
14	foregoing transcript is a true record of the testimony	13	REASON:	
15	given by the witness.	14		
16	Before completion of the deposition, review of the	15	REASON:	
17	transcript [X] was [] was not requested. If requested, any changes made by the deponent (and provided to the	16	DEACON.	
18 19	reporter) during the period allowed are appended hereto.	17 18	REASON:	
20	In witness whereof, I have subscribed my name this	19	REASON:	
21	day of, 2013.	20	REASON.	
22		21	REASON:	
		22		
23	DIANE S. MARTIN, CSR No. 6464	23	REASON:	
24		24		
25		25	REASON:	
	Page 283			Page 285
1	Page 283 INSTRUCTIONS TO WITNESS	1	ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF DEPONENT	Page 285
1 2	Page 283 INSTRUCTIONS TO WITNESS	1 2		Page 285
1 2 3	=		I,, do hereby certify that I have read the	Page 285
2	INSTRUCTIONS TO WITNESS Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary	3	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages, and that the same	Page 285
2	INSTRUCTIONS TO WITNESS Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason	2	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata	3	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4	I,, do hereby certify that I have read the foregoing pages, and that the same is a correct transcription of the answers given by me to the questions therein	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made. After doing so, please sign	2 3 4 5	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made. After doing so, please sign the errata sheet and date it. It will be	2 3 4 5 6 7	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made. After doing so, please sign the errata sheet and date it. It will be attached to your deposition.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made. After doing so, please sign the errata sheet and date it. It will be attached to your deposition. It is imperative that you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made. After doing so, please sign the errata sheet and date it. It will be attached to your deposition. It is imperative that you return the original errata sheet to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made. After doing so, please sign the errata sheet and date it. It will be attached to your deposition. It is imperative that you return the original errata sheet to the deposing attorney within thirty (30) days	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made. After doing so, please sign the errata sheet and date it. It will be attached to your deposition. It is imperative that you return the original errata sheet to the deposing attorney within thirty (30) days of receipt of the deposition transcript	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	I,	Page 285
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Please read your deposition over carefully and make any necessary corrections. You should state the reason in the appropriate space on the errata sheet for any corrections that are made.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I,	Page 285